

Race Equality Framework for Scotland

Education and Lifelong Learning

Evidence Paper (Updated May 2016)



This paper is divided into four parts:

1. Background
2. Key terms
3. Evidence and context
4. Appendix: Key underpinning threads and questions

Part One: Background

The Scottish Government has renewed its approach to race equality, having worked in partnership to develop a Race Equality Framework for Scotland to promote equality and tackle racism. This Framework will be in place for 2016-2030.

The Scottish Government led on this work with involvement and input from key stakeholders and with support from the Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights (CRER).

In the lead up to the development of the Race Equality Framework for Scotland, an Interim Evidence Paper collating a range of evidence and information on education and lifelong learning in the context of race equality was provided to stakeholders to assist in engagement and help frame discussion and further research.

This Evidence Paper has now been updated following additional research. The information provided is accurate and up-to-date to the best of CRER's knowledge at the time of publication.

Please note, the information contained in these evidence papers has been gathered by CRER across a range of sources including the Scottish Government and its Agencies research publications and National or Official statistics, in order to inform the development phase of the Race Equality Framework for Scotland. Scottish Government and its staff are not responsible for any content in these papers outside its own publications.

Why take action on education and lifelong learning?

Education and lifelong has been identified as one of the five priority areas¹ in the development of the new Race Equality Framework for Scotland due to the range of evidence demonstrating that minority ethnic groups are disadvantaged on a range of measures and indicators throughout these areas. Research suggests that minority ethnic people experience mismatches between educational qualifications and types of employment and discrimination within education. There is also disparity in regards to attainment and education experience across ethnic groups.

The evidence gathered on these subjects can be found in Part Three of this evidence paper.

¹ The other priority areas within the Framework are: community cohesion and safety; participation and representation; employability, employment and income; and health and home.

Key issues:

- Minority ethnic people experience variable outcomes in relation to education, with significant differences between different ethnic groups in terms of attainment and post-school destinations.
- High educational attainment in minority ethnic groups is coupled with a range of negative factors and experiences related to racism and structural discrimination which impact their experience in education, particularly within schools.
- High educational attainment does not translate to labour market advantage for minority ethnic people.

Part Two: Key terms

What do we mean by education and lifelong learning?

This section sets out the key terminology and context regarding education and lifelong learning used to develop the Race Equality Framework for Scotland.

Education

Education plays a critical role in enabling individuals to develop the knowledge, skills and experience to prepare them for employment and entry into the labour market.²

The role of educational attainment and achievement is of particular interest. *Educational attainment* refers to the qualifications and level of academic achievement reached by pupils and students, whereas *achievement* refers to success, especially in relation to personal accomplishments, according to the Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland.³

The Joseph Rowntree Foundation notes that, in relation to racial equality, it is often argued that raising educational attainment among minority ethnic pupils may be facilitated by the active promotion of racial equality in educational institutions and improving the ability of teachers to respond to specific needs in this regard. Evidence suggests that minority ethnic school leavers are generally outperforming the majority ethnic population, even in deprived areas, which raises issues relating to the over-representation of minority ethnic students in further education and under-representation in higher education. Furthermore, research indicates that educational attainment is not necessarily a route out of poverty for children and young people.⁴

Consideration of educational attainment, achievement and experience is critical to improving the circumstances of minority ethnic children and young people and is vital to creating racial equality.

Lifelong Learning

Lifelong learning is defined as “the provision or use of both formal and informal learning opportunities throughout people’s lives in order to foster the continuous development and improvement of the knowledge and skills needed for employment and personal fulfilment.”⁵ In Scotland, this could include additional education and training, adult education classes, community classes, and the provision of English as a Second Language (ESOL).

² Joseph Rowntree Foundation. [A review of poverty and ethnicity in Scotland.](#)

³ Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland. [Poverty, educational attainment, and achievement in Scotland.](#)

⁴ Joseph Rowntree Foundation. [A review of poverty and ethnicity in Scotland](#)

⁵ Collins Dictionary. [Lifelong Learning.](#)

Other key terms

The following are some terms and ideas that were useful in framing discussion about education and lifelong learning in Scotland.

Racial discrimination

Racial discrimination occurs when someone is treated unfairly or less favourably because of his or her race; this can occur in all spheres of public life. Racial discrimination does not need to be deliberate to be discrimination, and can take direct and indirect forms.⁶ Treating someone less favourably than another person due to their actual or perceived race, or the race of someone with whom they are associated, is direct racial discrimination. Indirect racial discrimination occurs when there is a condition, rule, policy or practice in an organisation that particularly disadvantages people who share the protected characteristic of race.⁷

Institutional racism

The report following the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry, also known as the Macpherson Report, which scrutinised the Metropolitan Police's mishandling of their investigation into the 1993 murder of Black British teenager Stephen Lawrence, defined institutional racism as:⁸

"... the collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate and professional service to people because of their colour, culture or ethnic origin. It can be seen or detected in processes, attitudes and behaviour which amount to discrimination through unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness and racist stereotyping which disadvantage minority ethnic people."

In Scotland, research from CRER has shown that institutional racism is present throughout society, including in the criminal justice system, the NHS, housing, and education sectors.⁹

Unconscious bias

Research suggests that explicit conscious racial bias begins at approximately five years of age, but, when not supported, tends to fade from ten to twelve years of age, as children become more aware of principles of fairness and social justice. Implicit unconscious racial bias can develop as young as three years of age and are resistant to change throughout adulthood, according to the Guardian, drawing on research from American academics.¹⁰

Several studies have found that in Western countries, on tests of unconscious racial bias, approximately 70% of majority ethnic individuals show a preference for their own race. The Implicit Association Test measures how quickly individuals are able to categorize photos of members of their own race with positive characteristics and members of a minority ethnicity with negative characteristics. Unconscious racial biases can have real-world consequences, particularly regarding employment. Studies have shown that, when presented with identical,

⁶ Citizens Advice. [Discrimination because of race.](#)

⁷ Equality Law. [Types of discrimination: definitions.](#)

⁸ The UK Government. [The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry.](#)

⁹ Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. [Institutional Racism: Scotland Still Has Far to Go.](#)

¹⁰ The Guardian. [How can we fix unconscious racism?](#)

moderately good resumes attached to a photograph of a white or non-white candidate, interviewers were significantly more likely to shortlist the white candidate for an interview.¹¹

Intersectionality

Intersectionality considers the interaction of various aspects of identity that might be associated with a risk of inequality, such as race and ethnicity, sex, gender identity, age, religion, disability and sexual orientation. Additionally, economic class, skills, qualifications, being born in the UK and experience can change the meaning or impact that some demographic characteristics have, according to the Joseph Rowntree Foundation.¹² Issues of poor equality monitoring, viewing minority ethnic groups and individuals as one group, and additional marginalisation and discrimination continue to affect minority ethnic communities.¹³

Social capital

Social capital describes the networks among people and the shared values which arise from those networks; greater interaction among people generates a greater sense of community spirit. The Office for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) defines it as, “networks together with shared norms, values and understandings that facilitate co-operation within or among groups.”¹⁴ Those with extensive networks are known to have better educational achievement, better employment outcomes and better health.¹⁵

According to the Scottish Government, understanding and building social capital could help develop strategies to create strong, resilient communities. Exploration of social capital in Scotland found that levels vary across socio-economic and demographic groups, with those living in large urban areas, those living in the most deprived areas and those with no educational qualifications having the least social capital. Differences in social capital by ethnicity could not be concluded due to small sample sizes.¹⁶

¹¹ The Guardian. [How can we fix unconscious racism?](#)

¹² Joseph Rowntree Foundation. [Poverty and Ethnicity: A review of evidence.](#)

¹³ Centred. [Intersectionality Literature Review.](#)

¹⁴ Office for National Statistics. [Guide to Social Capital.](#)

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ The Scottish Government. [Exploring Dimensions of Social Capital in Scotland.](#)

Part Three: Evidence and Context

This section contains a summary of the context, key evidence and data available on education and lifelong learning for minority ethnic communities in Scotland. The focus is on the collation of statistical data, although the quality of the information gathered and its impact on practice is beyond the scope of this paper. It should be noted that evidence is lacking in several areas, or is not made publicly available or collected centrally.

With regard to ethnicity terminology, this paper reflects the research methods of its sources. There are differing definitions of the term 'minority ethnic'; some include only non-white groups, others encompass all groups who do not identify themselves as white British. In rare instances, all except for white Scottish are included. Where possible, we have stated that research is exploring differences between, for example, white and non-white ethnicity categories. However, many sources do not use clear definitions – for example using only 'minority ethnic', 'BME' or 'BAME,' without defining who exactly is included in these categories. In these cases we have used the terminology employed by the original authors (without judgement as to the suitability, appropriateness or validity of the terminology used).

It should be noted that this is not just an issue for research collation, but also for policy – broad headline categories fail to capture the intricacies of outcome and experience for specific minority ethnic groups.

Census Figures

The 2011 Scottish Census revealed that Scotland became more ethnically diverse from 2001 to 2011, with the non-white minority ethnic population doubling from 2% to 4% of the total population, or 210,996 people.¹⁷ Furthermore, 221,620 individuals identified as being non-British white (including white Irish, white Gypsy/Traveller, white Polish and 'other' white) accounting for approximately 4% of the population. Non-white minority ethnic groups also had a much younger age profile than most 'white' ethnic groups.¹⁸

Glasgow City and the City of Edinburgh are the largest Scottish local authorities, with approximately 20% of Scotland's population. Collectively, research shows that they house 51% of the minority ethnic population, with Glasgow having a population of 12% and Edinburgh having 8%. Aberdeen City (8%) and Dundee (6%) also have a higher percentage of non-white minority ethnic communities than other areas of Scotland.^{19 20}

Furthermore, according to the 2011 Scottish Census, minority ethnic households overall are more likely to be in urban areas in Scotland, with 85% of African households, 78% of Pakistani households and 77% of Chinese households living in large urban areas compared to 40% of all households. The 2010 Annual Population Survey reported that 0.8% of the population in rural areas were from a minority ethnic background compared with 4% of the population in urban areas.²¹

¹⁷ Scotland's Census 2011. [Ethnicity](#).

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ [Scotland's Census 2011](#).

²⁰ Joseph Rowntree Foundation. [How has ethnicity changed in Scotland?](#)

²¹ Scottish Government. [Ethnicity and Rural and Environment](#).

It is important to note an increase in the numbers of minority ethnic individuals who were born in the UK, rather than being recent migrants. The effects and impact of some aspects of race inequality for this group will differ in ways to that of recent migrants. According to the Scottish Government's analysis of the 2011 Scottish Census, half of Pakistani and Caribbean or Black groups were born inside the UK and over a quarter of Chinese, Indian and Bangladeshi individuals were born inside the UK.²²

Only the white Polish group indicated that less than 80% (71%) spoke, read, and wrote English well. All other ethnic groups reported above 80% speaking, reading and writing English well.²³

²² Scottish Government. [Analysis of Equality Results from the 2011 Census.](#)

²³ Scottish Government. [Analysis of Equality Results from the 2011 Census.](#)

Education and Lifelong Learning

There is a complex relationship between education, ethnicity and poverty. According to the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, evidence argues that educational attainment among minority ethnic pupils may be improved by active promotion of race equality in schools and by building the capacity of teachers to respond to specific needs in this regard. Evidence also suggests that at school-leaving age, minority ethnic pupils are outperforming the white majority ethnic pupils (although there is variation among ethnicities), including in deprived areas. This raises concerns regarding the over-representation in further education and under-representation in higher education of minority ethnic individuals in Scotland. Furthermore, studies demonstrate that educational attainment for minority ethnic pupils and students may not result in appropriate advantages in the job market, with certain ethnic groups earning lower pay than others.²⁴

The evidence presented here provides an overview of the main sources of information on education and ethnicity.

School

Demographics

The Pupil Census 2015 revealed that the ethnic composition of Scottish school pupils is as follows:²⁵

Ethnic composition of pupils, Scotland 2015

	Female	Male	Total	Total %
White – Scottish	274,793	258,084	559,877	82.4%
White – other	24,759	25,708	50,467	7.4%
White – Gypsy/Traveller	530	530	1,060	0.2%
White – Polish	5,166	5,486	10,652	1.6%
White – Irish	577	562	1,139	0.2%
Mixed	3,984	3,948	7,932	1.2%
Asian – Indian	2,372	2,562	4,934	0.7%
Asian – Pakistani	6,156	6,470	12,626	1.9%
Asian Bangladeshi	422	422	844	0.1%
Asian – Chinese	1,762	1,649	3,411	0.5%
Asian – other	1,765	1,782	3,547	0.5%
Caribbean / Black	458	488	946	0.1%
African	2,880	2,994	5,874	0.9%
Arab	754	822	1,576	0.2%
Other	1,333	1,417	2,750	0.4%
Not Known	5,942	6,219	12,161	1.8%
Total	333,653	346,143	679,796	100%

Source: Pupil Census 2015

²⁴ Joseph Rowntree Foundation. [A review of poverty and ethnicity in Scotland.](#)

²⁵ The Scottish Government. [Pupil Census 2015: Supplementary Data.](#)

This demonstrates that 91.8% of students are from a white ethnic background, with 82.4% being white Scottish. Meanwhile, students from a non-white minority ethnic background account for 6.5% of the whole, with 1.8% unknown. 'Other' white (7.4%), Asian Pakistani (1.9%), white Polish (1.6%) and mixed (1.2%) accounted for the highest percentages of ethnicities, following white Scottish.²⁶

Furthermore, the Pupil Census shows a higher overall proportion of minority ethnic pupils in school than would be anticipated given the minority ethnic percentage of the population (4% non-white minority ethnic and 8% minority ethnic (white and non-white)); this can be explained by the younger age profile of the minority ethnic population.

The Pupils Census 2015 further reported that:²⁷

- Throughout Scotland's primary schools, 90.5% of students were from a white ethnic background, with 79.9% from a white Scottish background and 7.2% from a non-white minority ethnic background.
- In Scotland's secondary schools, 93.4% of students were from a white ethnic background, with 85.8% from a white Scottish background and 5.6% from a non-white minority ethnic background.
- In special schools, 89.6% are from a white ethnic background, with 85.1% from a white British background and 8.5% from a non-white minority ethnic background (1.9% had unknown ethnicities).

²⁶ The Scottish Government. [Pupil Census 2015: Supplementary Data.](#)

²⁷ The Scottish Government. Pupil Census. [Primary pupils by ethnicity and stage.](#)

Pupil exclusions

Pupil exclusions relate to days of temporary exclusions and pupils removed altogether from the register ('permanent' exclusion). Scottish Government data below shows the rate of pupil exclusion for 2014-2015.²⁸

Pupil exclusions by ethnicity, Scotland 2014 - 2015

	Total Exclusions	Of which, removals	Pupils Excluded	Total Pupil Numbers (2014)	Exclusion rate per 1000 pupils	Pupil rate per 1000 pupils
Total	18,430	5	10,428	676,751	27.2	15.4
White Scottish	16,351	5	9,188	566,301	28.9	16.2
White Non-Scottish	1,069	-	623	57,240	18.7	10.9
Mixed	144	-	86	7,535	19.1	11.4
Asian	217	-	151	24,344	8.9	6.2
African / Black / Caribbean	144	-	100	6,193	23.3	16.1
Other	93	-	43	3,868	24.0	11.1
Not Known	308	-	170	11,270	27.3	15.1
Data Not Available	104	-	67	-	-	-

Exclusions: Exclusion Dataset 2014-2015

According to this data, the three ethnic groups who were highest in terms of pupil exclusion were white Scottish, not known and other.

²⁸ The Scottish Government. [Exclusions: Exclusion Dataset 2014-2015](#)

This graph shows the rate of pupil exclusion per 1000 pupils for 2009-2011, as reported by a study from CRER. While this data is older, it is more detailed in its breakdown of ethnic group.²⁹

Pupil exclusions by ethnicity, Scotland 2009-2011

White – UK	44
White – other	21
Mixed	27
Asian – Indian	10
Asian – Pakistani	19
Asian – Bangladeshi	14
Asian – Chinese	3
Asian – other	14
Black – Caribbean	59
Black – African	27
Black – other	26
Occupational Traveller	10
Gypsy/Traveller	57
Other Traveller	175
Other ethnicity	31
Unknown	35

Source: State of the Nation 2013: Education

The three groups who were highest in terms of pupil exclusion are ‘other’ Traveller, Black Caribbean and Gypsy Traveller. These three groups are also the lowest in terms of pupil numbers.³⁰

²⁹ Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. [State of the Nation 2013: Education.](#)

³⁰ Ibid.

Destinations and attainment

The Scottish Government data below details the percentage of school leavers from publicly - funded secondary schools in Scotland by follow-up destination for 2013-2014. Unknown ethnicities have been removed. ³¹

School leaver follow-up destinations by ethnicity, Scotland 2013-2014

	White Scottish %	White non-Scottish %	Mixed %	Asian Chinese %	Asian Indian %	Asian Pakistani %	Asian other %	African / Black/ Caribbean %	Other %
Higher education	37.9	41.6	44.6	76.0	58.1	55.6	59.8	53.7	46.6
Further education	24.1	29.7	25.6	12.6	21.2	24.5	25.2	29.7	27.8
Training	2.6	1.6	-	0.0	-	1.3	-	2.8	-
Employment	25.8	18.3	20.3	-	-	10.7	10.7	9.8	-
Voluntary work	0.4	.7	1.8	-	0.0	-	-	0.0	0.0
Activity agreement	0.7	1.1	-	0.0	3.4	-	0.0	0.0	0.0
Unemployment - seeking	6.7	4.5	4.3	-	0.0	6.1	-	-	6.0
Unemployment – not seeking	1.5	1.9	1.8	0.0	0.0	0.7	-	-	-
Unknown	0.3	0.7	-	0.0	-	0.0	0.0	-	-
Positive destination total	91.5	92.9	93.7	98.8	96.6	93.2	97.0	95.9	91.7
Total overall	45,095	2,320	399	167	203	689	234	246	133

Source: Attainment and leaver destinations supplementary data 2015

Based on this data, school leavers from non-white minority ethnic backgrounds appear to have higher levels of positive post-school destinations than white young people. Asian Chinese, 'other' Asian and Asian Indian ethnicities had the highest percentages of school leavers going onto positive destinations, while white Scottish, white non-Scottish and 'other' ethnicities had the lowest percentages. ³²

Attainment can also be measured based on the Scottish Credit and Qualifications Framework (SCQF), which is the national credit transfer system for all levels of qualification in Scotland. Using this framework:

- Level 4 is equal to Intermediate 1 at A-C, National 4, or Standard Grade (General)
- Level 5 is equal to Intermediate 2 at A-C; National 5 at A-C; or Standard Grade (Credit)
- Level 6 is equal to Higher A-C

³¹ Scottish Government. [Attainment and leaver destinations supplementary data](#). Percentage by follow up destination and ethnic background.

³² The Scottish Government. [Ethnicity and Employability, Skills and Lifelong Learning](#).

In 2013-2014, according to the Scottish Government, school leavers who identified their ethnicity as Asian Chinese had the highest levels of recorded attainment, with 91.1% of leavers having at least one qualification at SCQF level 6 or better. White Scottish school leavers, in contrast, have 58.2% attaining this level. Further details are in the chart below.³³

Percentage of school leavers attainment by ethnicity, 2013-2014³⁴

Ethnicity	1 or more SCQF level 4 or better	1 or more at SCQF level 5 or better	1 or more at SCQF level 6 or better
White Scottish	96.4	84.3	58.2
White non-Scottish	94.5	83.4	59.8
Mixed or multiple ethnic groups	96.8	89.3	68.4
Asian Indian	98.0	92.2	73.2
Asian Pakistani	98.1	90.3	70.1
Asian Chinese	99.4	97.6	91.1
Asian Other	97.9	94.0	74.4
African / Black / Caribbean	97.6	93.5	72.6
All other categories	91.8	80.6	60.4
Not disclosed / Not known	93.2	78.1	47.6

Source: Summary statistics for attainment, leaver destinations and healthy living 2015

Attitudes and experiences

A 2005 study for the then-Scottish Executive Education Department on the experiences of minority ethnic pupils in school revealed the following:³⁵

- Minority ethnic pupils presented themselves as eager to succeed in their lives and education and were impatient about barriers put in their way, whether by other pupils or teachers.
- Minority ethnic young people valued opportunities to interact with other minority ethnic people, but for many these opportunities did not exist.
- More ethnically diverse schools noted that minority ethnic pupils tended to stay within their own ethnic group and were taking action to further integrate pupils.
- Minority ethnic young people believed it was important to have a supportive peer group to feel included and confident enough to cope with racism and issues.
- Minority ethnic pupils were conscious of being ‘outsiders,’ even if they were born in Scotland and felt that their colour, nationality, language and religious background were determining factors in whether they were accepted by their peers.
- Minority ethnic girls felt especially constrained in participation in social or school activities, particularly at a secondary school level.
- Minority ethnic pupils felt schools lacked understanding of religious diversity, with some having to be absent as ‘off sick’ for important religious celebrations.

³³ The Scottish Government. [Ethnicity and School Education.](#)

³⁴ The Scottish Government. [Summary statistics for attainment, leaver destination and healthy living.](#)

³⁵ The Scottish Government. [Minority ethnic pupils’ experiences of school in Scotland.](#)

- Minority ethnic parents believed having strong head teachers was important in working towards racial inclusion and that recognising and valuing diversity was important for all schools to do.
- Teachers noted efforts to address issues of equality and fairness, such as holding multicultural events to recognise the cultures and faiths of minority ethnic pupils.
- Teachers felt inadequately prepared for working with pupils with little or no English.
- Teachers believed consideration needed to be given to developing ethnically-sensitive approaches to the curriculum, pupil support and assessment.
- Teachers gave special notice to attempts to avoid an exclusively 'Western' focus in the curriculum.
- Minority ethnic pupils were aware of their teachers' attempts to be inclusive and of their lack of confidence in engaging positively with minority ethnic communities.
- Race equality policy and practice varied widely across schools.
- Race equality was often encompassed within general equal opportunity statements and was not specifically mentioned.

The same study found the following factors affect the achievement and attainment of minority ethnic pupils: ³⁶

- The understanding of teachers in matters of race equality and racism;
- The confidence of teachers in addressing issues of diversity and their ability to respond to individual needs;
- Improved communication and home-school liaison;
- Explicit addressing of issues of racial, cultural, linguistic and faith diversity within the curriculum;
- An understanding of multiple discrimination issues;
- The need for effective ethnic monitoring and analysis of data.

³⁶ Scottish Government. [Minority ethnic pupils' experiences of school in Scotland.](#)

Free school meals

Scottish Government data from the publication Pupils in Scotland 2007 is detailed in the chart below:³⁷

Pupil ethnicity and registration for free school meals, 2007

	Pupils	Registered for free school meals	% registered for free school meals
White – UK	632,154	84,787	13%
White – Other	12,566	1,204	10%
Mixed	5,805	908	16%
Asian – Indian	2,591	148	6%
Asian – Pakistani	9,505	1,269	13%
Asian – Bangladeshi	511	46	9%
Asian – Chinese	2,246	95	4%
Asian – Other	2,538	417	16%
Black – Caribbean	124	16	13%
Black – African	2,431	551	23%
Black – Other	470	120	26%
Occupational Traveller	208	40	19%
Gypsy/Traveller	448	216	48%
Other Traveller	105	39	37%
Other	3,017	471	16%
Not Known or Disclosed	17,174	2,996	17%
Total	691,893	93,323	13%

Source: Pupils in Scotland, 2007

According to this data, students from a mixed, other Asian, Black African, other Black, Occupational Traveller, Gypsy/Traveller, other Traveller, or other ethnic group were more likely than the average to register for free school meals.

More recent data is not available, as the free school meal data, which is now drawn from the Healthy Living Survey, cannot be split by ethnicity.

It should be noted that whilst pupils may be registered for free school meals, they may not necessarily take up free school meals.³⁸ It should also be highlighted that there is still a perceived stigma around claiming free schools meals, meaning these figures are likely to be conservative.

³⁷ Scottish Government (2007). [Pupils in Scotland. Pupil ethnicity and registration for free school meals, 2003-2007.](#)

³⁸ Scottish Government. (2006) [High Level Summary of Equality Statistics: Extracted trends by ethnic group](#)

Teachers

There is also considerable under-representation of non-white minority ethnic teachers in the Scottish education system. Only 1% of primary and 2% of secondary teachers come from a non-white minority ethnic group, despite the fact that they make up 4% of the Scottish population.³⁹ BBC Scotland reports that the only one secondary school as a head teacher of a non-white minority ethnic origin in 2015.⁴⁰

Research conducted by the General Teaching Council for Scotland shows that in some Scottish schools there are significant numbers of pupils from minority ethnic communities, yet there appear to be very few teachers from these communities. It is clear that there are still barriers that young people from these communities face, especially those whose families are second or third generation residents of Scotland, that make teaching less attractive as a career for them.⁴¹

³⁹ Scottish Government. (2006) [High Level Summary of Equality Statistics: Extracted trends by ethnic group](#)

⁴⁰ BBC Scotland. [‘Lack of diversity’ among Scottish school heads.](#)

⁴¹ General Teaching Council for Scotland. Ian Matheson. [Current demographics in the school teaching population in Scotland](#)

Further Education

Demographics

A Joseph Rowntree Foundation study found that minority ethnic groups were over-represented in the further education sector, which is disparate with their relatively lower participation in higher education and their overall higher rates of attainment at school-leaving age.⁴²

According to CRER, the number of students in further education in Scotland based on ethnicity and sex is as follows as of 2010-2011:⁴³

Student numbers in further education by ethnicity, Scotland 2010-2011

	Male	Female	Total	Total %
White Scottish	96,336	114,075	210,924	82.5%
White British	4,966	6,588	11,554	4.5%
White Irish	589	664	1,253	0.5%
White Other	5,033	8,982	14,015	5.5%
Mixed	525	641	1,166	0.5%
Indian	801	620	1,421	0.6%
Pakistani	1,518	1,744	3,262	1.3%
Bangladeshi	172	129	301	0.1%
Chinese	466	888	1,354	0.5%
Asian Other	1,131	1,261	2,392	0.9%
Caribbean	115	89	204	0.1%
African	1,471	1,676	3,147	1.2%
Black Other	159	159	318	0.1%
Other	608	706	1,314	0.5%
Unknown	1,624	1,847	3,471	1.4%
Total	115,514	140,069	255,583	100%

Source: *State of the Nation 2013: Education*

White Scottish students accounted for 82.5% of the total, with white ethnic students comprising 93.0% and non-white minority ethnic students comprising 5.8% of the total. This includes only Scottish domiciled students.⁴⁴

There is also considerable gender variation between ethnic groups. The majority of students were female in ten of the 14 ethnic categories. Chinese, white British, 'other' white and mixed ethnicities showed the highest female bias, whereas Caribbean, Indian and Bangladeshi showed a strong male bias.⁴⁵

⁴² Joseph Rowntree Foundation. [Poverty and ethnicity in Scotland.](#)

⁴³ Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. [State of the Nation 2013: Education](#)

⁴⁴ Ibid.

⁴⁵ Ibid.

The same study found evidence of variation in age within ethnic groups, with:⁴⁶

- 16-18: relatively greater presence within white Scottish, Pakistani and mixed ethnic groups, and relatively lower presence with 'other' white and African ethnic groups.
- 19-24: relatively greater presence within mixed, Indian, Pakistani, Chinese and Bangladeshi ethnic group.
- 25-64: relatively greater presence within 'other' white, Caribbean, African, 'other' Black and 'other' ethnic groups, and relatively lower presence within white Scottish, Indian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi and mixed ethnic groups.

Dropout rate

A study from CRER also examined the dropout rate for students in further education:⁴⁷

Dropout rates from further education by ethnicity, Scotland 2010-11

White Scottish	16%
White English	14%
White Welsh	16%
White Irish	14%
White Other	17%
Mixed	18%
Indian	21%
Pakistani	22%
Bangladeshi	16%
Chinese	21%
Other Asian	25%
Caribbean	28%
African	23%
Black Other	15%
Other	21%
Unknown	10%
Median	18%

Source: State of the Nation 2013: Education

Caribbean, 'other' Asian, African, Pakistani, Indian, Chinese and 'other' ethnic groups had an elevated drop-out rate.⁴⁸

⁴⁶ Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. [State of the Nation 2013: Education](#)

⁴⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁸ Ibid.

Course preference

In regards to course preference, variation was found among ethnic groups with:

- *Business management*: >5% above median: Indian
- *Food technology and catering* : >5% above median: Indian, Bangladeshi
- *Computing*: >5% above median white English, white Irish, African
- *Art and design*: >5% above median: Mixed
- *Health*: >5% above median: white Scottish; >5% below median: Bangladeshi, Chinese
- *Social work* : >5% above median: 'other' white, Bangladeshi, Chinese, 'other' Asian; >5% below median: white Scottish, white English, white Welsh, white Irish, mixed.⁴⁹

Enrolment

The most recent enrolment figures from the Scottish Funding Council suggest there were 17,144 enrolments from a minority ethnic background in 2014-15, which accounts for 5.8% of total enrolments. In 2013-14, this cohort accounted for 16,284 enrolments, or 5.4% of total enrolments. Of the 2014-15 enrolments from a minority ethnic background, 4,135 were from an African background whilst 3,020 were from a Pakistani background.⁵⁰

⁴⁹ Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. [State of the Nation 2013: Education](#)

⁵⁰ Scottish Funding Council (2016). [Baseline Report for Academic Year 2014-2015](#)

Higher Education

Demographics

A study from CRER compared the numbers of white students and non-white students in higher education in 2010-2011. Ethnic groupings were changed for this data, given the lower numbers of students in higher education from a minority ethnic background compared to further education or school.⁵¹

Student numbers in higher education by ethnicity, Scotland 2010-11

	Total	% of total	% of total excluding unknown	% of non-white minority ethnic
White	160,525	91.9%	94.5%	
Black	1,635	0.9%	1.0%	17.5%
Asian	5,220	3.0%	3.1%	55.9%
Mixed	1,850	1.1%	1.1%	19.8%
Other	640	0.4%	0.4%	6.8%
Unknown	4,780	2.7%		
Total	174,650			
Total excluding unknown	169,870			

Source: *State of the Nation 2013: Education*

In total, 5.6% of higher education students are from a non-white minority ethnic background, which is slightly lower than that of those in further education.⁵²

The Scottish Government reports that, according to the Annual Population Survey 2010, degrees are held by 32% of people with a non-white minority ethnic background compared to 20% for all white ethnic people. However, lower qualification rates tend to be either the same or lower in the non-white minority ethnic group as the white group.⁵³

⁵¹ Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. [State of the Nation 2013: Education](#)

⁵² Ibid.

⁵³ The Scottish Government. [Ethnicity and Employability, Skills and Lifelong Learning](#).

Dropout rate

The study from CRER also examined the dropout rate for students in higher education:⁵⁴

Dropout rates from higher education by ethnicity, Scotland 2010-11

	Total	First degree	Other qualification
White	12.1%	10.2%	30.8%
Black	16.9%	15.9%	
Asian	9.4%	8.8%	21.1%
Mixed	10.8%	9.6%	29.2%
Other	12.4%	13.4%	

Source: *State of the Nation 2013: Education*

The dropout rate was highest for the Black and 'other' ethnic groups, with Asian and mixed ethnic groups having the lowest dropout rates.⁵⁵

Course preference

In regards to course preference, variation was found among ethnic groups with:

- *Medical and related*: the mixed ethnic group had a relatively low percentage selecting this option
- *Science and engineering*: the white ethnic group had the lowest percentage selecting this option;
- *Business and social studies*: Black and Asian ethnic groups had relatively high percentages selecting this option; the white ethnic group had lower percentages selecting this option;
- *Education and the arts*: Black and Asian ethnic groups had relatively low percentages selecting this option; the white ethnic group had the highest percentage electing this option.⁵⁶

Overall qualification levels

The following data from the 2011 Scottish Census demonstrates the highest level of qualification among ethnic groups. The categories are as follows:

- *No qualification*: no qualification
- *Level 1*: Ordinary Grade (O Grade), Standard Grade, Access 3 Cluster, Intermediate 1 or 2, General Certificate of Secondary Education (GCSE), Certificate of Secondary Education (CSE), Senior Certificate, General Scottish Vocational Qualifications (GSVQ) Foundation or Intermediate, Scottish Vocational Qualifications (SVQ) Level 1 or 2, Scottish Vocational Education Council (SCOTVEC) Module, City and Guilds Graft, or equivalent
- *Level 2*: Scottish Certificate of Education (SCE) Higher Grade, Higher, Advanced Higher, Certificate of Sixth Year Studies (CSYS), Advanced Level (A Level),

⁵⁴ Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. [State of the Nation 2013: Education](#)

⁵⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁶ Ibid.

Advanced Subsidiary Level (AS Level), Advanced Senior Certificate, GSVQ Advanced, SVQ Level 3, Ordinary National Certificate (ONC), Ordinary National Diploma (OND), SCOTVEC National Diploma, City and Guild Advanced Craft, or equivalent

- *Level 3*: Higher National Certificate (HNC), Higher National Diploma (HND), SVQ Level 4 or equivalent, other post-school but pre-Higher Education qualification
- *Level 4 and above*: Degree, postgraduate qualifications, Masters, PhD, SVQ Level 5, professional qualifications, other higher education qualifications.⁵⁷

Qualification level for all ethnicities⁵⁸

No qualifications	1,173,116	26.8%
Level 1	1,010,875	23.1%
Level 2	627,423	14.3%
Level 3	424,996	9.7%
Level 4 and above	1,142,662	26.1%
Total	4,379,072	

Source: Scottish Census 2011: Highest Level of qualification by ethnicity

Qualification level for white ethnicities⁵⁹

No qualifications	1,147,738	27.2%
Level 1	985,236	23.3%
Level 2	610,188	14.5%
Level 3	410,612	9.7%
Level 4 and above	1,067,628	25.3%
Total	4,221,402	

Source: Scottish Census 2011: Highest Level of qualification by ethnicity

Qualification level for non-white minority ethnicities⁶⁰

No qualifications	25,378	16.1%
Level 1	25,639	16.3%
Level 2	17,235	10.9%
Level 3	14,384	9.1%
Level 4 and above	75,034	47.6%
Total	157,670	

Source: Scottish Census 2011: Highest Level of qualification by ethnicity

In all categories except Level 4, there is a higher percentage of those in the white ethnic group than of those in non-white minority ethnic groups. Only in the non-white minority ethnic group do a higher percentage (47.6%) have a Level 4 qualification compared to the white ethnic group (25.3%).

⁵⁷ Scotland's Census 2011. [Highest Level of Qualification.](#)

⁵⁸ Scotland's Census 2011. [Highest level of qualification by ethnicity.](#)

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ Ibid.

According to the Equality and Human Rights Commission's (EHRC) report "Is Scotland Fairer?" in 2008, people from non-white minority ethnic groups were more likely to have a degree than white people (31.5% of people from non-white minority ethnic groups compared with 20.3% of white people). By 2013, the gap had increased, with 48.3% of people from non-white minority ethnic groups holding a degree compared with 25.7% of white people.⁶¹

Early Years Education and Childcare

According to the Summary Statistics for Schools in Scotland, in September 2015, 8.3% of children registered for early learning and childcare had a home language which was not English.⁶²

The Scottish Government's report "Growing up in Scotland: Birth Cohort 2" revealed the following:⁶³

- Compared with the average child, early communication skills were less well developed if a child had a main carer from a non-white ethnic group.
- Families in which the respondent was white were more likely to be using childcare than those where the respondent was from a non-white ethnic background (53% vs 33% respectively).
- In families using childcare, 80% of those where the respondent was from a non-white ethnic background used only one provider, compared to 68% of white families.
- Compared with those from non-white ethnic backgrounds, those from white backgrounds were more likely to be using any type of informal childcare provision (79% compared to 69% respectively), with those from a white background more likely to be using a mix of informal and formal care (17% compared to 9 % respectively) and less likely to be using only formal arrangements (21% compared to 31% respectively).

Findings from the first birth cohort in the Scottish Government's Growing Up in Scotland study found that, after accounting for parent education, having non-white parents is associated with a decrease in vocabulary ability during the pre-school period.⁶⁴

A Glasgow-based study on the impact of poorer health outcomes and lifestyle behaviours of adults (in addition to relative economic depression) on the social, emotional and behavioural development of children in Glasgow compared to other parts of Scotland found that children were more likely to fall into the 'abnormal' range of the Total Difficulties score (which looks at levels of social, emotional and behavioural difficulties) if they had a non-white UK ethnicity.⁶⁵ This suggests that children from minority ethnic groups may need more support the preschool years in regards to social, emotional and behavioural development.

⁶¹ Equality and Human Rights Commission. (2015). [Is Scotland Fairer?](#) Data from the Labour Force Survey

⁶² Scottish Government. [Ethnicity and Children and Families](#).

⁶³ Scottish Government (2013). [Growing Up in Scotland: Birth Cohort 2 – Results from the first year](#).

⁶⁴ Scottish Government (2011). [Growing Up in Scotland: Changes in cognitive ability in the pre-school years](#).

⁶⁵ Marryat, L., Thompson, L., Minnis, H., and Wilson, P. (2015) [Exploring the social, emotional and behavioural development of preschool children: is Glasgow different?](#) International Journal for Equity in Health.

In its “Poverty and Ethnicity: Key Messages for Scotland” report, the Joseph Rowntree Foundation noted that childcare and early education plays an important role in preventing and reducing poverty. High quality early education can protect children from the negative impacts of poverty and improve their development, which may lead to better educational outcomes later in life. Flexible and affordable childcare can also reduce pressure on family’s incomes and help parents remain economically active. The report suggests that childcare providers should design their services to be welcoming and inclusive to parents and children from all ethnic backgrounds, and should take positive action to increase the diversity of their staff in line with local population profiles.⁶⁶

Racial Equality in Schools

In a 2004 study for the then-Scottish Executive’s Education Department about the experience of minority ethnic pupils in school, difficulties in taking forward race equality in schools were discovered. The research found that:⁶⁷

- Teachers did not agree about the best way to teach minority ethnic pupils fairly, with some preferring not to single them out based on their ethnicity and others believing that it was important to be conscious to the ethnicity of pupils.
- Minority ethnic teachers, pupils and parents wanted teachers to be more astute about diversity and to acknowledge and appreciate ethnicities present in their school.
- Teacher confidence on race equality matters is varied, with many suggesting a need for additional training.
- Those teachers who are not confident about race equality matters are less likely to place race equality issues on the learning and teaching agenda.
- Many teachers, minority ethnic parents and minority ethnic pupils believed it would be beneficial if the numbers of minority ethnic teachers in Scotland were increased.
- Teachers were largely unaware about how multiple discrimination might affect pupils who were from a minority ethnic background, but may, for example, also face poverty or sexism or have a disability.
- Minority ethnic parents wanted more communication and dialogue with their children’s teachers, especially for those who face multiple issues.
- The quality of communication was largely dependent on the school’s approachability and awareness of barriers to communication.
- Minority ethnic parents were conscious of having to work hard at home to assert ethnic, cultural and linguistic identities for their children in the face of the ethnocentricity of the society in which they lived.

The research also found that institutional racism has an impact of minority ethnic pupils’ sense of inclusion or exclusion. A minority of teachers and senior managers spoke of a multi-agency partnership approach to tackling racism and racial bullying in schools by developing links with the community police and voluntary sector.⁶⁸

⁶⁶ Kelly, M. Joseph Rowntree Foundation. (2016) [Poverty and Ethnicity: Key Messages for Scotland](#).

⁶⁷ The Scottish Government. [Minority ethnic pupils’ experiences of school in Scotland](#).

⁶⁸ Ibid.

Overall, teachers did not report frequent or systematic racial incidents or bullying. There was not a unanimous approach about how to approach the issues or consensus about whether racial bullying was different than other forms of bullying. Many thought racist incidents in school were on the decline or rare.⁶⁹

However, racism, both direct and indirect, was a daily feature for many of the minority ethnic pupils interviewed, who recounted racist incidents, name-calling, harassment and bullying both within and outwith the school. Some believed their school did not do enough to support them and prevent bullying. Among the staff of schools, some teachers believed some of their colleagues had issues in terms of equality and race equality in particular, and were worried about racist and ignorant views of fellow teachers.⁷⁰

There is a need to listen to the concerns and opinions of minority ethnic young people about their experiences in school, given the difference between what they perceive and experience and what their teachers perceive and experience.⁷¹

BBC Scotland reported 1,274 racist incidents in Scottish schools between 2011 and 2012 – 730 in primary schools and 544 in secondary schools.⁷² A report from Muslim Engagement and Development (MEND) found that in Glasgow schools, there was 155% increase in racially aggravated assaults since 2010, from 18 cases to 46 cases in 2014. North Lanarkshire recorded a 28% from 21 in 2010 to 27 in 2014. In East Renfrewshire there was a 23% rise in racially motivated incidents in schools, up from 47 in 2010 and 58 in 2014.⁷³

In 2013 CRER surveyed local authority education departments for policy relating to racist incident reporting. It was found that Angus, Dundee, Edinburgh and Inverclyde had excellent policy, with East Dunbartonshire, Falkirk, Glasgow, Renfrewshire, West Dunbartonshire and West Lothian having good policy. Five had above average policy, and 15 had only basic policy; two did not respond to the study in time. There was large variation across local authorities in terms of prevention, action, monitoring, assessment, evaluation, staff training and enforcement.⁷⁴

Similarly mixed results in terms of local authority policy were found in the EHRC Scotland's 2015 research into prejudice based bullying in schools. The qualitative element of the research also found significant concerns about racism in schools, including concern on the part of the researchers that in some cases racist views had been expressed during the focus groups examining prejudice based bullying. Just over half of teachers surveyed for this study reported being aware of bullying within their school based on race or ethnicity. On a more positive note, over 80% of pupils surveyed said they would be willing to report bullying on the grounds of race or ethnicity.⁷⁵

⁶⁹ The Scottish Government. [Minority ethnic pupils' experiences of school in Scotland](#).

⁷⁰ Ibid.

⁷¹ Ibid.

⁷² BBC Scotland. [Figures show racist incidents in schools](#).

⁷³ Mend. [Racist incidents rising in Scottish schools](#).

⁷⁴ Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. [Racist Incident Reporting in Schools](#).

⁷⁵ Lough Dennell, B.L., and Logan, C. (2015) [Prejudice-based bullying in Scottish schools: A research report](#). EHRC Scotland.

Appendix: Key underpinning threads and questions

The concepts outlined throughout this evidence paper provided perspective and additional scope when discussion these issues in the related action forums, which had the same themes as the evidence papers.

These action forums were organised by CRER and the Scottish Government and brought practitioners, policy makers and other stakeholders together to identify priorities and solutions for each theme.

The key underpinning threads and questions for discussion listed below were used to frame and drive forward these workshops. Complete write-ups from these action forums can be found at www.crer.org.uk.

Key underpinning threads for the purposes of this paper may be grouped in the following way:

Education and lifelong learning

- Structures, policies and practices of educational institutions in early learning, school, further and higher education and community learning and development sectors
- The home learning environment and parental involvement in learning
- Curriculum for Excellence
- Extra-curricular learning
- Assessment of learning, including progress monitoring and examination systems
- Education, training and career-long professional learning for teachers, tutors and lecturers
- The learner experience, and issues specific to race equality such as experience of racism, institutional discrimination and structural barriers
- Educational guidance and pastoral care
- Innovations in teaching and learning practice
- Additional support for learning
- Factors within the educational environment which impact learners' future career options, including subject choice, careers guidance, work experience and vocational learning
- Post-school transitions and positive destinations for school leavers
- Barriers to accessing post-school learning – further/higher education and community learning and development (including English as a Second or Other Language learning)
- Qualifications and the Scottish Credit and Qualifications Framework
- Education inspection, review and scrutiny

Throughout the police development process, the following questions were raised for further exploration and discussion.

Education and lifelong learning

- How and why does the learning experience differ for minority ethnic individuals and what can be done to ensure equality?

- What are the factors that drive high educational attainment for some minority ethnic communities, and how can that potential be harnessed by all?
- How can we harness the potential of Curriculum for Excellence to promote race equality in the classroom, tackle racial stereotyping, increase community cohesion and reduce prejudice?
- What effective approaches can we use to build educators' capacity on race equality through their own education, training and career-long professional learning?