Race Equality Framework for Scotland
Participation and Representation

Evidence Paper (Updated May 2016)

This paper is divided into four parts:

1. Background

2. Key terms

3. Evidence and context

4. Appendix: Key underpinning threads and questions

Part One: Background

The Scottish Government has renewed its approach to race equality, having worked in partnership to develop a Race Equality Framework for Scotland to promote equality and tackle racism. This Framework will be in place for 2016-2030.

The Scottish Government led on this work with involvement and input from key stakeholders and with support from the Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights (CRER).

In the lead up to the development of the Race Equality Framework for Scotland, an Interim Evidence Paper collating a range of evidence and information on participation and representation in the context of race equality was provided to stakeholders to assist in engagement and help frame discussion and further research.

This Evidence Paper has now been updated following additional research. The information provided is accurate and up-to-date to the best of CRER's knowledge at the time of publication.

Please note, the information contained in these evidence papers has been gathered by CRER across a range of sources including the Scottish Government and its Agencies research publications and National or Official statistics, in order to inform the development phase of the Race Equality Framework for Scotland. Scottish Government and its staff are not responsible for any content in these papers outside its own publications.

Why take action on participation and representation?

Participation and representation has been identified as one of the five priority areas[1] in the development of the new Race Equality Framework for Scotland due to the range of evidence suggesting that minority ethnic people tend to have lower participation rates than white majority ethnic people in a variety of public arenas and are not proportionally represented in elected bodies and decision making structures across Scotland.[2]

The evidence gathered on these subjects can be found in Part Three of this evidence paper.

---

[1] The other priority areas within the Framework are: community cohesion and safety; education and lifelong learning; employability, employment and income; and health and home.
[2] UK Parliament. Ethnic Minorities in Politics and Government.

Key issues:

- There are lower levels of participation among minority ethnic communities compared to the white British majority ethnic community a range of activities which contribute to individual and social development in Scotland. This includes democratic processes, mainstream arts and cultural participation, and participation in sports and leisure.
- Minority ethnic communities are under-represented in political, governance and decision making structures, as well as in other areas of public life which influence opinion and policy such as the media.
- There is a lack of data regarding the participation and representation of minority ethnic communities in several spheres of public life.
- There are barriers connected to institutional and personal racism that limit the participation and representation of minority ethnic communities.
- Slow progress in improving the participation and representation of minority ethnic communities suggests that current approaches are not adequately addressing these barriers. More action is needed to achieve fair and equal participation and representation.

Part Two: Key Terms

What do we mean by participation and representation?

While there are no single universally recognised understandings of either participation or representation, this section sets out the key terminology and context regarding participation and representation used to develop the Race Equality Framework for Scotland.

Participation

Participation is defined as, "the action of taking part in something."[3] There are several dimensions to participation that are important to explore.

According to the Pathways through Participation research project: [4]
- Political participation is the engagement of individuals with the various structures and institutions of a democracy, such as voting in elections or standing to be an elected official.
- Social or community participation refers to collective activities with which individuals may be involved, such as being a member of a community group or trade union or volunteering.
- Individual participation involves the everyday choices and actions that individuals make in context of the society they want to live in, such as playing a sport or going to an art exhibition.

In the context of participation, these categories can be fluid and overlap.

Research from Involve, a think tank specialising in public participation, demonstrates that participation can help societies to identify solutions to complicated problems, improve the efficiency and effectiveness of public services, promote social cohesion and social justice, build the capacity and confidence of individuals and communities and reduce social problems.[5] This suggests that effective and equal participation for minority ethnic communities is vital to creating racial equality.

Representation

Representation is defined as "the action of speaking or acting on behalf of someone or the state of being so represented; the description or portrayal of someone or something in a particular way; or formal statements made to an authority."[6] In the context of racial equality, the concept of representation is particularly focused on ensuring fair and proportionate representation of minority ethnic communities in all areas of public life.

This paper will address these concepts by exploring representation on elected bodies, on public boards and in other public spheres. Representation in employment has been

---

[3] Oxford English Dictionary. Participation.
[4] Pathways through Participation. Understanding Participation: Literature Review.
[5] Involve. "Our Mission and Vision."
[6] Oxford English Dictionary. Representation.

addressed in CRER's accompanying Employability, Employment and Income evidence paper.

Other key terms

The following are some terms and ideas that could be useful in framing discussion about participation and representation in Scotland.

Influencing

Influence is defined as the capacity to have an effect on the character, development or behaviour of someone or something, or the effect itself. This can include the power to shape policy or ensure favourable treatment.[7]

In the context of this paper, equality of influence means that minority ethnic groups would have a fair and proportionate level of influence in the public sphere, whether in politics, in the community sector or in arts and heritage.

Social capital

Social capital describes the networks among people and the shared values which arise from those networks; greater interaction among people generates a greater sense of community spirit. The Office for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) defines it as "networks together with shared norms, values and understandings that facilitate co-operation within or among groups."[8] Those with extensive networks are known to have better educational achievement, better employment outcomes and better health.[9]

According to the Scottish Government, understanding and building social capital could help develop strategies to create strong, resilient communities. Exploration of social capital in Scotland found that levels vary across socio-economic and demographic groups, with those living in large urban areas, those living in the most deprived areas and those with no educational qualifications having the least social capital. Differences in social capital by ethnicity could not be concluded due to small sample sizes.[10] As with participation, if minority ethnic communities do not have equality in their experience of building social capital, racial equality will be impossible to achieve.

Co-production and collaboration

The Scottish Co-Production Network states that co-production describes a relationship between a service provider and a service user that draws on the knowledge, ability and resources of both to develop effective, sustainable solutions to issues. This relationship also changes the power dynamic between the provider and user and may foster a more equal and reciprocal relationship.[11]

---

[7] Oxford English Dictionary. Influence.
[8] Office for National Statistics. Guide to Social Capital.
[9] Ibid.
[10] The Scottish Government. Exploring Dimensions of Social Capital in Scotland.
[11] Scottish Co-Production Network. What is Co-Production?

The Connected Communities research programme notes that there has been a recent emphasis on attempts to reach out to so called "hard to reach" groups. Defining communities in this way, however, constructs a dichotomy between the mainstream and the marginalised and forces consideration as to why some engagement attempts may be seen as exclusionary. Some groups which public bodies have difficulty reaching can include recent migrants, asylum seekers and minority ethnic groups, among many others.[12]

Power-sharing

According to Beyond Intractability, a project developed by the University of Colorado Conflict Information Consortium, power-sharing, beyond the notion of coalition governments, holds the principles of protection for minority rights, the decentralisation of power and decision making by consensus.[13] Outside of formal political agreements, this term has been applied to majority groups with more power being willing to give up some of that power in order to tackle inequalities in our society.

Tokenism

Tokenism refers to viewing the experiences of minority ethnic groups in trivial or marginal ways, often as a way to be seen to be addressing racial inequality. Universities Scotland notes that this can occur when special events are held to showcase a culture as a one-off occasion which does little to affect or challenge the mainstream. [14] At times, one minority ethnic individual can be used as a token in involvement to create a superficial appearance of equality of participation and representation. Tokenism also occurs where minority ethnic individuals are wrongly assumed to represent their entire community or all minority ethnic communities in their involvement.

Stereotyping

Universities Scotland states that stereotyping occurs when an individual is viewed in terms of the supposed characteristics of a group or culture and assumptions about their behaviour or personality are made.[15]

Stereotyping is particularly relevant to issues of media representation (which in turn is connected to representation of minority ethnic people within the media industry workforce, addressed later in this paper). In a 2002 British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC) report entitled "Multicultural Broadcasting: concept and reality" those from minority ethnic groups who were questioned stated that their country of origin was not portrayed at all or was portrayed negatively in the media. There was also marked concern about the stereotypical portrayal of certain issues and the belief that, even when minority ethnic people were represented, some characters were included simply because of their ethnicity and were not well-developed or important.[16]

---

[12]Connected Communities. Towards Co-Production in Research with Communities.
[13] Beyond Intractability. Power Sharing.
[14] Universities Scotland. Race Equality Toolkit.
[15] Ibid.
[16] The BBC. Multicultural Broadcasting: concept and reality.

Intersectionality

According to the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, intersectionality considers the interaction of various aspects of identity that might be associated with a risk of inequality, such as race and ethnicity, sex, gender identity, age, religion, disability and sexual orientation. Additionally, economic class, skills, qualifications and experience can change the meaning or impact that some demographic characteristics have.[17] Centred, an LGBT community organisation, states that issues of poor equality monitoring, viewing minority ethnic groups and individuals as one group and additional marginalisation and discrimination continue to affect minority ethnic communities.[18]

Racial discrimination

Racial discrimination occurs when someone is treated unfairly or less favourably because of his or her race; this can occur in all spheres of public life. Racial discrimination does not need to be deliberate to be discrimination, and can take direct and indirect forms.[19] Treating someone less favourably than another person due to their actual or perceived race, or the race of someone with whom they are associated, is direct racial discrimination. Indirect racial discrimination occurs when there is a condition, rule, policy or practice in an organisation that particularly disadvantages people who share the protected characteristic of race.[20]

Institutional racism

The report following the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry, also known as the Macpherson Report, which scrutinised the Metropolitan Police's mishandling of their investigation into the1993 murder of Black British teenager Stephen Lawrence, defined institutional racism as: [21]

> "… *the collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate and professional service to people because of their colour, culture or ethnic origin. It can be seen or detected in processes, attitudes and behaviour which amount to discrimination through unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness and racist stereotyping which disadvantage minority ethnic people.*"

In Scotland, research from CRER has shown that institutional racism is present throughout society, including in the criminal justice system, the NHS, housing, and education sectors.[22]

---

[17] Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Poverty and Ethnicity: A review of evidence.
[18] Centred. Intersectionality Literature Review.
[19] Citizens Advice. Discrimination because of race.
[20] Equality Law. Types of discrimination: definitions.
[21] The UK Government. The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry.
[22] Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. Institutional Racism: Scotland Still Has Far to Go.

Part Three: Evidence and Context

This section sets out the context, key evidence and data available on participation and representation for minority ethnic communities in Scotland. The focus is on the collation of statistical data, although the quality of the information gathered and its impact on practice is beyond the scope of this paper. It should be noted that evidence is lacking in several areas, or is not made publicly available or collected centrally.

With regard to ethnicity terminology, this paper reflects the research methods of its sources. There are differing definitions of the term 'minority ethnic'; some include only non-white groups, others encompass all groups who do not identify themselves as white British. In rare instances, all except for white Scottish are included. Where possible, we have stated that research is exploring differences between, for example, white and non-white ethnicity categories. However, many sources do not use clear definitions – for example using only 'minority ethnic', 'BME' or 'BAME,' without defining who exactly is included in these categories. In these cases we have used the terminology employed by the original authors (without judgement as to the suitability, appropriateness or validity of the terminology used).

It should be noted that this is not just an issue for research collation, but also for policy – broad headline categories fail to capture the intricacies of outcome and experience for specific minority ethnic groups.

Census Figures

The 2011 Scottish Census revealed that Scotland became more ethnically diverse from 2001 to 2011, with the non-white minority ethnic population doubling from 2% to 4% of the total population, or 210,996 people.[23] [24] Furthermore, 221,620 individuals identified as being non-British white (including white Irish, white Gypsy/Traveller, white Polish and 'other' white) accounting for approximately 4% of the population.[25]

Glasgow and the City of Edinburgh are the largest Scottish local authorities, with approximately 20% of Scotland's population. Collectively, they house 51% of the minority ethnic population, with Glasgow having a minority ethnic population of 12% and Edinburgh 8%. Aberdeen City (8%) and Dundee (6%) also have a higher percentage of minority ethnic communities than other areas of Scotland.[26] [27]

Furthermore, according to the 2011 Scottish Census, minority ethnic households overall are more likely to be in urban areas in Scotland, with 85% of African households, 78% of Pakistani households and 77% of Chinese households living in large urban areas compared to 40% of all households. The 2010 Annual Population Survey reported that 0.8% of the population in rural areas was from a minority ethnic background compared with 4% of the population in urban areas.[28]

---

[23] Scotland's Census 2011. Ethnicity, Identity, Language and Religion.
[24] Scotland's Census 2011. Ethnicity.
[25] Ibid.
[26] Scotland's Census 2011.
[27] Joseph Rowntree Foundation. How has ethnicity changed in Scotland?
[28] Scottish Government. Ethnicity and Rural and Environment.

It is important to note an increase in the numbers of minority ethnic individuals who were born in the UK, rather than being recent migrants. The effects and impact of some aspects of race inequality for this group will differ in ways to that of recent migrants. According to the Scottish Government's analysis of the 2011 Scottish Census, half of Pakistani and Caribbean or Black groups were born inside the UK and over a quarter of Chinese, Indian and Bangladeshi individuals were born inside the UK.[29]

Only the white Polish group indicated that less than 80% (71%) spoke, read, and wrote English well. All other ethnic groups reported above 80% speaking, reading and writing English well.[30]

Meanwhile, 14% of the population of the UK has a non-white minority ethnic background, according to the Policy Exchange.[31] While this has not been addressed in the accompanying evidence papers, the minority ethnic population of the UK is relevant here due to the use of UK-wide data.

Political Participation

A significant portion of the data in the following two sections is UK-wide or was published prior to the independence referendum in Scotland. Much may have changed in Scotland since then.

Electoral Registration

Across the UK, a 2015 study from Runnymede Trust estimated that as many as 20% of non-white minority ethnic people are not registered to vote, compared to 7% of white majority ethnic people. The rate of non-registration is highest among the Black African group at 28%.[32]

In Scotland, The Guardian reported that 97% of eligible individuals registered to vote in the Scottish independence referendum.[33] Statistics detailing the percentage of minority ethnic individuals registered to vote in the referendum were not readily available.

However, following changes introduced to the Electoral Register ahead of the 2015 General Election, many voters failed to switch to the new system of registration. A January 2015 report from The Herald Scotland found that Glasgow alone faced a 22% drop in voter registration. A significant drop in registration following the referendum was expected.[34] Figures regarding the percentage of minority ethnic individuals still registered to vote was not readily available. Scotland-specific data on minority ethnic electoral participation is often difficult to find. [35]

---

[29] Scottish Government. Analysis of Equality Results from the 2011 Census.
[30] Scottish Government. Analysis of Equality Results from the 2011 Census.
[31] Policy Exchange. A Portrait of Modern Britain.
[32] Runnymede Trust. Race and Elections.
[33] The Guardian. Scottish independence: 97% register to vote in the referendum.
[34] The Herald Scotland. Electoral Register changes lead to huge drop in Scots voter numbers.
[35] Runnymede Trust. Race and Elections.

Runnymede Trust has reported that, overall, minority ethnic people are disproportionately under-registered in the UK. Some foreign-born or non-UK citizen minority ethnic individuals believe that they are not entitled to vote, although qualifying citizens of the Commonwealth, British Overseas Territories and the European Union are eligible to vote in UK elections. Further awareness of eligibility requirements is needed. Additionally, those who have recently changed addresses may have not re-registered, which particularly affects young people in the UK. With over 20% of 18-21 year-olds in the UK coming from a Black and minority ethnic (BME) background, disenfranchisement of young people affects BME communities disproportionately.[36]

Concerns have also been raised following changes in the electoral registration process which require individuals to register on the new system, rather than the "head of the household."[37] As one in six BME women stated that someone else in the household filled out their registration form, according to Runnymede Trust, this change may disproportionately disenfranchise non-white minority ethnic women.[38] Additional efforts may be needed to ensure BME women remain on the register.

Political Engagement

According to the Electoral Commission, evidence suggests that dissatisfaction with political parties is a contributing factor to low levels of political participation by BME communities. The voter turnout rate is also thought to be affected by lack of representation in high-profile public positions. Additional contributing factors included the younger age profile of non-white minority ethnic communities, comparatively higher levels of social and economic deprivation and higher levels of urban living where voter turnout levels tend to be lower than average.[39]

A UK-wide audit of political engagement found that fewer BME individuals (23%) had discussed politics with someone in the previous two to three years, compared to 39% of individuals in white ethnic groups. Only 1% of BME individuals had contacted an elected representative in the previous two to three years. BME communities are divided about the value of being involved in politics at a national level, with 36% believing that getting involved will not change the way the United Kingdom is run.[40] A report from the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) entitled "Is Scotland Fairer?" found that young people aged 16 to 24 and individuals from minority ethnic groups were less likely to be politically active than older people and white people.[41]

The House of Commons Library Briefing paper found that there were significant differences between non-white minority ethnic groups, though overall, minority ethnic groups were more likely to be satisfied with democracy in the UK than white ethnic groups, but have lower levels of knowledge about politics and participation in political activities. Non-white minority ethnic individuals were less likely to be on the electoral register (although factors other than ethnicity are likely to affect this as well) and less likely to vote.[42]

---

[36] Runnymede Trust. Race and Elections. "Registration and Race."
[37] UK Government. Biggest change to voter registration in a generation.
[38] Runnymede Trust. Race and Elections. "Registration and Race."
[39] The Electoral Commission. Social Exclusion and Political Engagement.
[40] Ibid.
[41] Ibid.
[42] House of Commons Library Briefing Paper. Political disengagement in the UK: Who is disengaged?

However, another study found that those from minority ethnic communities are often involved in politics in alternative ways, such as supporting single issue campaigns, rather than traditional party politics. This type of political engagement focuses on issues that particularly affect communities and that individuals believe will have an impact on their lives.[43]

Similarly, a 2008 CRER study found that non-white minority ethnic individuals in Scotland were less likely than their majority ethnic counterparts to be a member of a political party or participate in politics through political parties, finding parties to not be representative of the wider population. Rather, they were more likely to be involved in civic and community activities and campaigns. Fear of racism was cited as a barrier to more traditional political engagement.[44]

The situation appears to have changed in Scotland in 2014 with the independence referendum, which featured minority ethnic individuals at the forefront of both campaigns. A report from Runnymede Trust demonstrated that there was no indication of apathy among young BME voters. For minority ethnic communities in Scotland, as with other communities, political participation is not limited to electoral participation or political party membership, but extends beyond to wider social and political issues.[45]

---

[43] The Equality and Human Rights Commission. Is Scotland Fairer?
[44] Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. Political Participation.
[45] Runnymede Trust. Race and Elections.

UK Parliament and UK Government

In the 2015 General Election, the non-white minority ethnic Member of Parliament (MP) candidates and successfully elected MPs were as follows for the 59 seats in Scotland: [46] [47]

2015 General Election candidates by party and ethnicity

	Total Candidates	Non-white Minority Ethnic Candidates	% of Non-white Minority Ethnic Candidates	Elected Non-white Minority Ethnic MPs	% of Elected Non-white Minority Ethnic MPs
Scottish National Party	59	1	1.7%	1	1.7%
Scottish Labour Party	59	3	5.1%	0	0%
Scottish Liberal Democrats	59	3	5.1%	0	0%
Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party	59	2	3.4%	0	0%
Scottish UK Independence Party (UKIP)	36	1	2.3%	0	0%
Scottish Green Party	31	0	0%	0	0%
Total	303	10	3.3%	1	1.7%

Source: Parliamentary Candidates UK

Additionally, as of May 2016, only one of 22 UK Cabinet Ministers are from a non-white minority ethnic background, as well as one minister who also attends Cabinet.[48]

According to Operation Black Vote, of the 790 members eligible to take part in the work of the House of Lords, only 45 are BME peers.[49] Analysis demonstrates that, as such, only one in 18 eligible peers are BME.[50]

---

[46] Parliamentary Candidates UK. UK Elects Most Diverse Parliament.
[47] UK Parliament. Frequently Asked Questions: MPs.
[48] UK Government. Ministers.
[49] Operation Black Vote. Parliamentarians and campaigners.
[50] Democratic Audit UK. How democratic is the UK's House of Lords?

Scottish Parliament and Scottish Government

In the 2011 Holyrood Election, the non-white minority ethnic Member of the Scottish Parliament candidates and successfully elected MSPs were as follows for the 129 seats in Scotland: [51] [52] [53]

2011 Holyrood Election candidates by party and ethnicity

	Total Candidates	Non-white Minority Ethnic Candidates	% of Non-white Minority Ethnic Candidates	Elected Non-white Minority Ethnic MSPs	% of Elected Non-white Minority Ethnic MSPs
Scottish National Party	102	3	2.9%	1	0.78%
Scottish Labour Party	114	7	6.1%	1	0.78%
Scottish Liberal Democrats	87	3	3.4%	0	0%
Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party	66	2	3.0%	0	0%
Scottish Green Party	44	1	2.3%	0	0%
Total	413	16	3.9%	2	1.6%

Source: The Guardian Election Results 2011

The non-white minority ethnic candidates who were standing were often not placed in so-called winnable seats or were placed low on the regional lists. Five non-white minority ethnic candidates would need to be elected to accurately reflect Scotland's population.

While two non-white minority ethnic MSPs were elected in 2011, the Scottish Parliament reports that only one non-white minority ethnic MSP was elected in 2007 and none were elected in 2003 or 1999. [54]

As of April 2016, one Scottish Government Minister was from a non-white minority ethnic background; the other 22 were from a white ethnic background. [55]

---

[51] The Guardian. Election Results 2011: equalities and diversity in Holyrood, Cardiff Bay and Stormont. Data: Scotland 2011 Results.
[52] The Guardian. Scottish Parliament and Welsh Assembly elections 2011: how diverse are the candidates? Data: Scotland 2011 Candidates.
[53] Scottish Parliament. Current MSPs.
[54] Scottish Parliament. 2011 Election.
[55] Scottish Government. The Scottish Cabinet.

2016 Scottish Parliament elections

There was insufficient time before publication of the evidence papers to include results from the 2016 Scottish Parliament elections.

Scottish Local Authorities

In the 2012 Scottish local elections, for the total of 1223 seats, the non-white minority ethnic councillor candidates and successfully elected councillors were as follows: [56] [57]

2012 Scottish Local Election non-white minority ethnic candidates by party

	Non-white Minority Ethnic Candidates	Elected Non-white Minority Ethnic Candidates
Scottish National Party	9	5
Scottish Labour Party	12	11
Scottish Liberal Democrats	4	1
Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party	3	0
Scottish Green Party	0	0
Other	4	0
Total	32	17

Source: Minority Ethnic Representation in the 2012 Local Government Elections

According to CRER, only 1.4% of councillors in Scotland are from a non-white minority ethnic background. Forty-nine non-white minority ethnic councillors are needed to accurately reflect the population. The overall number of non-white minority ethnic councillors increased from previous local council elections, from ten in 2007 to 17 in 2012.[58]

Seven local councils have at least one non-white minority ethnic councillor, with: [59]

- Glasgow City electing seven;
- North Lanarkshire electing three;
- East Dunbartonshire electing two;
- Dundee City electing two;
- Dumfries and Galloway electing one;
- Aberdeen City electing one; and
- East Lothian electing one.

This means that 25 of 32 local councils do not have any non-white minority ethnic councillors, including the City of Edinburgh Council.

The number of female non-white minority ethnic councillors has increased from zero in the last election to four, with all non-white minority ethnic women who stood being elected.[60]

---

[56] The Guardian. Racial equality in Scottish councils: less male, less stale but still very pale.
[57] Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights. Minority Ethnic Representation in the 2012 Scottish Local Government Elections.
[58] Ibid.
[59] Ibid.
[60] Ibid.

However, these four women represent just 0.3% of all elected councillors in Scotland. Twenty-four female non-white minority ethnic councillors would be needed to accurately represent the population.

Candidacy and election

According to Runnymede Trust, possible explanations for the UK-wide low numbers of BME elected officials are complex. It has been suggested that discrimination plays a critical role from selection by parties, to campaigning, to securing election. BME people may not put themselves forward to be selected for seats, either due to disengagement from politics or the party system, expectations of discrimination or not fitting the stereotypical profile of an elected official.[61]

Research undertaken in 2010 by Runnymede Trust demonstrated that BME candidates tended to attract lower vote shares and that incumbent MPs did better when facing a BME opponent. Evidence suggests that BME parliamentary candidates faced an electoral penalty due to their ethnicity. Evidence is mixed about whether BME candidates experience an increase in votes from BME voters.[62]

Scottish Community Councils

The ethnic composition of Scotland's community councils was not readily available and it is understood data is not routinely collected in many areas.

Scottish Political Parties

Information is not readily available publically regarding the ethnicity of the membership of Scottish political parties. When recently contacted by CRER to ascertain whether ethnic monitoring of their membership was conducted, four of the five major parties in Scotland reported that they did not monitor this, with one stating that monitoring had recently begun at a UK level.

Ahead of the 2015 General Election, the Labour Party,[63] the Liberal Democrat Party,[64] and the Green Party of England and Wales [65] launched manifestos specifically targeted to minority ethnic communities; this may be an effort to improve participation in parties for minority ethnic communities. Other parties, although not all of them, referenced race equality

---

[61] Runnymede Trust. Race and Elections.
[62] Ibid.
[63] The Labour Party. A Better Future for Britain's BAME Communities.
[64] Liberal Democrats. Black Asian and Minority Ethnic Manifesto.
[65] The Green Party of England and Wales. BAME Election Manifesto 2015.

15

explicitly in their manifesto. [66] [67] [68] [69] [70] [71] The publication dates for the 2016 Scottish Parliament election manifestos did not allow for analysis in this evidence paper.

Public and Third Sector Boards

Non-departmental Public Bodies

According to the Scottish Government's Public Appointments website, a public body is an organisation which generally receives at least 50% of its funding from the central government. Executive non-departmental public bodies (NDPB) are not part of the Scottish Government Directorate and are generally managed by a Board whose members are appointed by a Minister. They have a remit to carry out administrative, commercial, executive or regulatory functions at an arm's length from the government.[72]

The Scottish Government reports that for 2015, 5.3% of public appointment applicants had a minority ethnic background, with 5.2% of those appointed having a minority ethnic background. [73] In 2014, 4.8% of applicants had a minority ethnic background, with 2.4% of those appointed having a minority ethnic background.[74]

A baseline study conducted in 2013 to identify the overall ethnicity profile of NDPB Board membership found that, of 519 total members, 94% were from a white ethnic group, 4% were of unknown ethnicity and 2% were from a non-white minority ethnic group.[75]

Of the 34 executive NDPBs in Scotland: [76]

- One reported 4% of staff from a minority ethnic background;
- 14 reported less than 4% of staff from a minority ethnic background;
- Five had less than 1% of staff from a minority background; and,
- Twelve did not have data on the ethnicity of their staff readily available.

This could have an effect on the participation of minority ethnic communities in the related fields, such as the creative industries, tourism, enterprise and culture. It may also affect appointment to boards of these public bodies.

---

[66] The Scottish National Party. Manifesto 2015.
[67] The Scottish Labour Party. Manifesto 2015.
[68] Scottish Liberal Democrats. Manifesto 2015.
[69] The Scottish Conservatives. Manifesto 2015.
[70] The Scottish Green Party. Manifesto 2015.
[71] UK Independence Party. Manifesto 2015.
[72] Public Appointments Scotland. About Public Bodies.
[73] Public Appointments Scotland. The right people for the roles.
[74] Public Appointments Scotland. Public Appointments Diversity Report 2014.
[75] Data provided by the Scottish Government Public Appointments and Diversity Centre of Expertise
[76] Data was gathered from an audit of organisations' websites, equality statements and equality impact assessments, and is available upon request.

Women on Boards

In 2014, following from the Women 50:50 campaign,[77] the Scottish Government consultation "Women on Board: Quality through Diversity" sought responses to inform how the Scottish Government would shape its proposals to the UK Government on using legislation to achieve gender equality on the boards of public bodies, through the use of mandatory quotas for women. The consultation also asked if there should be quotas for people with other protected characteristics and if there were barriers in place that impacted certain groups of women. [78]

Analysis of the responses indicates that minority ethnic women featured very little in the majority of responses, although there was slightly more support for introducing quotas for people with protected characteristics other than gender than for not doing so. A few of the respondents noted that minority ethnic women face additional or greater barriers than other women. Overall, many respondents felt that quotas were a step in the right direction and that boards should be given the opportunity to reach the voluntary targets already in place.

Third Sector Boards

A 2009 study by the Association of Chief Officers of Scottish Voluntary Organisations (ACOSVO) of the third sector in Scotland revealed that, of the boards of the organisations researched, 83.3% of board members were either white Scottish or white British, with 16.7% being from an 'other' ethnic group or not reporting. Additionally, 88.9% of chairs reported being white British or white Scottish, with 11.1% being from an 'other' ethnic group or not reporting.[79] Grouping non-white ethnic groups with unknown ethnicities hinders analysis and does not make it clear whether the non-white minority ethnic membership is 0%, 15%, or somewhere in between.

The Office of the Scottish Charity Regulator (OSCR) does not report on the ethnic composition of its Board,[80] and did not address the ethnic compositions of the sector in their equality strategy.[81]

Of the ten highest grossing charities in Scotland that were not universities or education institutions, none had statistics or information about the ethnic composition of their board or directors readily available.[82] However, using name recognition algorithms, CRER identified four non-white minority ethnic trustees out of approximately 120 (3.3%), with two of the four being trustees of Glasgow Life.

---

[77] Women 50:50.
[78] The Scottish Government. Women on Board: Quality through Diversity consultation.
[79] ACOSVO. Boards, Governance and Leadership of the Third Sector. Scotland Study.
[80] OSCR: The Scottish Charity Regulator. OSCR Board.
[81] OSCR: The Scottish Charity Regulator. Equality Strategy 2012-2015.
[82] Data was gathered from an audit of websites and public information about the boards of these organisations, and is available upon request.

Public Honours

In 2012, the Queen awarded a total of 1,201 people for a public honour across the UK. Six percent of these were from minority ethnic communities.[83] In 2015, 1,163 people received an award. Of these, 6.9% were from minority ethnic communities, which is a slight rise from 2012. Statistics about the ethnic composition of those from Scotland were not readily available.[84]

Community Planning

According to the Scottish Government, community planning aims to ensure communities are genuinely engaged in decisions made about public services which affect them and commits organisations to work together to provide quality public service.[85]

An Audit Scotland report of community planning partnerships did not provide national statistics about the ethnic composition of these partnerships.[86]

A 2009 study by Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland (BEMIS) found that of the voluntary faith-based and community organisations from diverse minority ethnic communities in Scotland who were surveyed: [87]

- 66% knew how to contact their Community Planning Partnership;
- 50% had no contact or were simply receiving information; and,
- 6% were actively involved in being represented on one of the committees.

Furthermore, when asked about barriers to engagement: [88]

- Almost 75% stated that the main barrier was not knowing enough about community planning;
- 52% did not see community planning as relevant to their needs; and,
- 46% did not understand enough about the issues they were dealing with.

It should be noted that there was only a 12% response rate to this survey (74 of 600 organisations), and as such, results may not be representative of member organisations more generally.

It was felt there were barriers such as a lack of dedicated support for engagement of minority ethnic communities, lack of openness to new views and lack of time among those who were employed.[89]

---

[83] Politics. Honours System.
[84] UK Government. Birthday Honours lists 2015.
[85] The Scottish Government. Community Planning in Scotland.
[86] Audit Scotland. The role of community planning partnerships in economic development.
[87] BEMIS. Report on Poverty and Community Planning Survey for Minority Ethnic Communities.
[88] Ibid.
[89] Ibid.

Volunteering and Voluntary Groups

A report by the Scottish Government found an insignificant difference between individuals from white ethnic backgrounds and non-white ethnic backgrounds who volunteer – 19.8% compared to 18.1%.[90] In 2014, 2% of volunteers for third sector organisations were from a non-white ethnic background. [91]

According to a 2004 report published by BEMIS: [92]

- Volunteering as a concept exists within minority ethnic communities, particularly among younger generations;
- A high level of informal volunteering takes place within minority ethnic communities that is not recognised or recorded by mainstream volunteering organisations;
- Minority ethnic individuals may feel as though it is easier to volunteer among those of the same background, as in some cases, they will not need to make requests for specific provisions according to their culture or faith and they are able to share experience with their own community;
- Training that is only offered in the English language may be a barrier; and,
- Motivations for minority ethnic individuals to volunteer are not dissimilar to those of the whole population, although links to faith and family values are stronger.

A 2007 BEMIS survey of volunteer centres in rural and urban areas found variance in the existence and quality of policies and practices surrounding engagement with minority ethnic individuals. Noted key factors for supporting minority ethnic individuals included: [93]

- Having good monitoring and evaluation systems;
- Identifying areas for improvement;
- Being proactive in the recruitment of minority ethnic volunteers; and,
- Having quality procedures and support services for volunteers and associated organisations.

Girlguiding Scotland and Scouts Scotland strongly encourage new members from diverse cultures and backgrounds, and state their commitment to equality. No information was readily available about the ethnicity of their members.[94] [95] Scouting aims to be as diverse as the UK's communities by 2018, and asks members to continue to engage with minority ethnic communities, migrants and foreign nationals recently settling in the UK.[96] Edinburgh Muslim Scouts aims to promote activities and personal development opportunities for young people with an Islamic ethos.[97]

---

[90] The Scottish Government. Scottish Household Survey Analytical Topic Report: Volunteering.
[91] The Scottish Government. Ethnicity.
[92] BEMIS. A Way of Life: Black and Minority Ethnic Diverse Communities as Volunteers.
[93] BEMIS. A Review by BEMIS of Engagement by Volunteer Centres in Scotland with Volunteers from Diverse Ethnic Minority Communities.
[94] Girlguiding Scotland. Inclusion and Diversity.
[95] Scouts Scotland. Equal Opportunities.
[96] Scouts. Developing Scouting in new communities.
[97] Salaam Scouts. About.

Housing associations and tenants group

Shelter Scotland stresses that residents' associations should be representative of the whole community, use positive images of minority groups and avoid stereotypes, challenge racist remarks and develop an equal opportunities policy.[98] Information about the ethnicity of housing associations and tenants groups across Scotland is not readily available.
The Scottish Federation of Housing Association does not have information readily available regarding the ethnic composition of their Board.[99] The Glasgow Housing Association also does not publically state the ethnic composition of its Board.[100]

Scottish-specific equality duties do not apply to the Scottish Housing Regulator, the independent public body that regulates social landlords and housing activities. However, the organisation states that it will "act in the spirit of specific duties" by publishing an equality statement and equality outcomes. Statistics about the ethnicity of the Regulator's own Board was not readily available.[101] However, data provided by the Scottish Housing Regulator found that non-white minority ethnic individuals comprise 3.5% of the governing bodies of social landlords, with 93.3% being from white ethnic backgrounds and 3.2% having an unknown ethnicity.[102]

Trade unions

According to the Scottish Government, a trade union is a democratic voluntary membership organisation formed and developed to benefits its members by collectively working to pursue their interests in workplaces and society. Across the UK, union membership tends to be higher in terms of women, highly educated workers, disabled workers and UK-born minority ethnic workers.[103] The Department for Business Innovation and Skills reports that approximately 27% of UK-born employees are in unions compared to 18% of non-UK born workers, and 29% of non-white minority ethnic workers were members of trade unions, compared to 26% of all employees in 2013. Female minority ethnic employees were more likely to belong to unions than males. [104]

However, the Scottish Trade Union Congress (STUC) reported in 2004 that trade union membership among non-white minority ethnic workers in Scotland was estimated to be low, although specific figures of trade union membership were not available. Figures at the time suggested that 95% of trade union members across the UK were from white ethnic backgrounds. BME workers are often employed in the private sector, such as in the retail, hotel and restaurant sectors, which tend to be less well-unionised sectors of the economy. This could contribute to the low unionisation rates. However, well-unionised public sectors, such as public administration and education, have among the lowest levels of BME

---

[98] Shelter Scotland. Tenants' and residents' associations.
[99] Scottish Federation of Housing Associations. Board of Directors.
[100] Glasgow Housing Association. GHA Board.
[101] Scottish Housing Regulator. Equality Statement 2013-2015.
[102] Scottish Housing Regulator. Statistical Information. Charter data – all social landlords dataset.
[103] The Scottish Government. Understanding Trade Unions.
[104] National Statistics. Department for Business Innovation and Skills. Trade Union Membership Statistical Bulletin 2013.

employees. Furthermore, it is estimated that BME workers are predominately employed in small workplaces; only 8% of workplaces with less than 25 people have union members.[105]

Many trade unions have formed national, regional and local Black Members Committees to improve the influence and participation of Black members. The STUC Black Workers Committee brings together non-white minority ethnic representatives from across the Trade Union movement in Scotland.[106]

Information about the membership of non-white minority ethnic workers compared to white majority ethnic workers was not readily available. The extent to which ethnicity monitoring is carried out by trade unions is unclear.

Arts and Culture

For the purposes of this report, "culture" refers to a wide range of creative industries, including theatre, opera, ballet, cinema, music, literature and heritage / historical activities.[107] In the broader sense, creative industries also include architecture, advertising, computer games, fashion and broadcasting.

The Scottish Government reported in 2013 that: [108] [109]

- 91% of the white ethnic group is culturally engaged, compared to 90% of non-white minority ethnic groups;
- Participation in cultural activity is 78% for the white ethnic groups and 74% for non-white minority ethnic groups; and,
- Attendance at a cultural event or place is 80% for the white ethnic groups and 82% for non-white minority ethnic groups

This appears to contradict other findings, however this is partially explained by the fact that this data includes attendance at 'culturally specific festivals'. Non-white minority ethnic attendance at culturally specific festivals, libraries and museums was higher than for the white majority ethnic group. However, the size of the non-white minority ethnic sample is very small so results should be treated with caution.

A breakdown of participation by specific ethnicity categories was not available. Minority ethnic individuals tend to be under-represented in participation and attendance at mainstream arts and cultural events in Scotland. A literature review conducted by the Scottish Government found that minority ethnic communities view mainstream art and culture as consisting of opera, ballet, Shakespearean theatre, classical music and art galleries. Although minority ethnic groups recognise the role played by these, they were

---

[105] Scottish Trade Union Congress. Trade Union and Black and Minority Ethnic Workers in Scotland.
[106] Scottish Trade Union Congress. STUC Black Workers' Committee.
[107] Examples taken from the Scottish Government statistics on cultural participation for 2009.
[108] The Scottish Government. Ethnicity and Culture.
[109] The Scottish Government. People, Culture and Heritage in Scotland.

thought to be "not for them." Concern often surrounds their portrayal of history and there is a desire for more exhibits relating to their own culture.[110]

The National Galleries estimate that 9% of those who visit the galleries reported having a non-white minority ethnic background. [111] This will include foreign visitors.

The Scottish Government literature review also found that those who are not interested in mainstream arts were often interested in arts relating to their cultural heritage. Participation in arts and cultural events enhance the pride minority ethnic individuals feel for their own culture and offer and opportunity celebrate their culture and empower their community.[112]

Furthermore, creative activity was common in minority ethnic communities, including arts as part of wider social, religious or cultural festivities; attendance at events showcasing art and drama from their heritage; and performances derived from minority ethnic experiences in Britain. Qualitative research suggests that minority ethnic artists wish to be recognised for the value of their own work and desire more inclusive events and opportunities to share their work.[113]

A study identified the main barriers to cultural and arts participation as lack of time, cost, lack of interest, irrelevance, lack of awareness and information, lack of understanding, language, feeling out of place and social barriers.[114]

Creative Scotland, the NDPB that funds and supports the development of Scotland's creative industries states an aim to more accurately reflect the diversity of Scotland through their funding, engagement and employment practices. Of the 3860 people employed with its funded organisations, 4% were from a non-white minority ethnic background. Several funded organisations have high levels of engagement with non-white minority ethnic communities, particularly those in Glasgow. Engagement with non-white minority ethnic communities was also evident in some of the equalities-focused organisations recommended for regular funding in 2015.[115]

However, Creative Scotland felt that organisations with a significant focus on non-white minority ethnic communities and artists were "not yet ready" for regular funding and as such, identified development needs to be addressed and encouraged these organisations to develop their work through the Open Project funding scheme.[116]

---

[110] The Scottish Government. A Literature Review of the Evidence Base for Culture, the Arts and Sports Policy.
[111] National Galleries Scotland. Equality. Equality Outcomes 2013-2017 Progress Report.
[112] The Scottish Government. A Literature Review of the Evidence Base for Culture, the Arts and Sports Policy.
[113] Ibid.
[114] Ibid.
[115] Creative Scotland. Regular Funding: Full Equality Impact Assessment.
[116] Ibid.

Published breakdowns of ethnicity of main performers or Board members were not readily available for the Scottish Ballet[117], the Scottish Opera[118], the National Theatre of Scotland,[119] the Scottish Chamber Orchestra,[120] or Scotland's National Orchestra.[121]

Sport and Leisure

The Scottish Health Survey 2012 found that Pakistani respondents were the least likely to obtain the recommended levels of physical activity – 27% compared to the national average of 38% - and were also the least likely ethnic group to participate in sport – 30% compared to 49%. This finding is consistent with Britain-wide research, which found that Pakistani and other South Asian ethnic groups were the least likely to be sufficiently physically active. (There were no other ethnic groups in the Scottish survey that were significantly different from the national average.) [122]

Another sportscotland report, which utilised data from 2006, took into account that the non-white minority ethnic population is, on the whole, younger than the general population and tends to be focused in cities. It found that: [123]

- For those aged 25-34, 74% of white ethnic individuals participated in sport compared to 60% of non-white minority ethnic individuals;
- For those aged 35-44, 69% of white ethnic individuals participated in sport compared to 51% of non-white minority ethnic individuals; and,
- For those aged 45-54, 63% of white ethnic individuals participated in sport compared to 33% of non-white minority ethnic individuals.

A UK-wide study reported that the overall sports participation rate for non-white minority ethnic groups was 40%, compared to the national average of 46%. The lowest participation rates were Bangladeshi women (19%), Pakistani women (21%) and Indian (31%) women.[124]

A literature review for Sporting Equals found that in Scotland, fear of racial discrimination keeps minority ethnic groups from participating in sport and recommends that racism in sport be fully addressed. [125]Additional UK-based studies recognised that, in addition to the barriers to physical activity that affect the general population such as lack of time and energy or confidence, particular barriers affected minority ethnic communities. These barriers included:

- Being unaware of availability, cost and opening hours;
- Fear for personal safety in public spaces;

---

[117] The Scottish Ballet. Scottish Ballet Board.
[118] Scottish Opera. About Us.
[119] National Theatre of Scotland. Board of Directors.
[120] Scottish Chamber Orchestra. Who's Who.
[121] Scotland's National Orchestra. Musicians.
[122] The Scottish Government. Scottish Government Equality Outcomes: Ethnicity Evidence Review. Sport.
[123] sportscotland. Population and Participation Profiles: Key equity figures.
[124] The Scottish Government. Scottish Government Equality Outcomes: Ethnicity Evidence Review. Sport.
[125] The Scottish Government. Scottish Government Equality Outcomes: Ethnicity Evidence Review. Sport.

- Lack of other people from their communities using the facilities; and,
- Actual or potential experiences of racism.

Some South Asian respondents to the study also noted dress codes, lack of privacy in changing areas and lack of single-gender provision.[126]

A qualitative study from sportscotland found several barriers for participation for minority ethnic groups. These included: [127]

- Cultural or religious beliefs and expectations;
- Attitudes and expectation of 'significant others';
- Not perceiving a value in sport;
- A lack of encouragement;
- Difficultly in assessing information;
- Lack of awareness about facilities or activities;
- Lack of others from their community participating in sport;
- Not seeing role models form their community;
- Not matching the 'accepted' face of sport in Scotland;
- Lack of culturally or religiously appropriate environments or activities; and
- Racial discrimination.

Scottish Natural Heritage research on participation in outdoor recreation in Scotland found very similar levels of outdoor recreation among non-white minority ethnic individuals (83%) and white ethnic individuals (82%).[128] However, non-white minority ethnic individuals were less likely to regularly participate in natural heritage and outdoor recreation, with 42% reporting weekly participation compared to 50%.[129]

Historic Scotland's contribution to the Scottish Government's Equality Outcomes and Mainstreaming Report for 2015 states that participation in heritage and conservation activities are lower for people from minority ethnic groups, although data is not provided. Historic Scotland reports that it currently has a focus on improving minority ethnic participation through a funded project based at West of Scotland Regional Equality Council.[130]

Media

The National Union of Journalists believe that media organisations in Scotland have a duty to promote diversity in the workplace and media. The organisation states that a lack of non-white minority ethnic individuals in the media can result in a lack of desire among others in

---

[126] The Scottish Government. Scottish Government Equality Outcomes: Ethnicity Evidence Review. Sport.

[127] sportscotland. Sport and Ethnic Minority Communities: Aiming at Social Inclusion.

[128] Scottish Natural Heritage. Scotland's People and Nature Survey 2013/2014.

[129] Scottish Natural Heritage. Scotland's People and Nature Survey 2013/2014, Special Interest Report No.2 - Participation in Outdoor Recreation: Under-represented groups.

[130] Historic Scotland. Equality Outcomes and Mainstreaming Report.

the non-white minority ethnic community to enter the field and a lack of diverse stories of non-white minority ethnic groups being told in the media.[131]

Concerns have been raised about the visibility of non-white minority ethnic communities in the media. A Creative Skillset UK-wide report found that representation of non-white minority ethnic individuals had declined from 7.4% of the workforce in 2006 to 5.4% in 2012.[132]

Lenny Henry's British Academy of Film and Television Arts (BAFTA) Television Lecture 2014 called for a more proactive approach to encourage more productions to use non-white minority ethnic actors and production staff and noted that British non-white minority ethnic actors have difficulty finding work in the UK.[133]

The BBC has set a goal to advance equal opportunities to diversify and develop their workforce at all levels. BBC Scotland, according to its March 2015 Diversity Update, had 2.6% (30 individuals) of its staff from a BME background in January 2015. This was a decrease from 2.9% (35 individuals) in February 2014. BBC Scotland aims to increase this to 4.0% by 2017. Additionally, in January 2015, one individual (2.3%) was at a Grade 10 and above level (which includes senior management).[134]

In 2015, Scottish Television (STV) employed 430 permanent staff across Scotland and London and claims a commitment to promoting diversity within their workforce and on-screen and has implemented training programmes and policies to promote equality of opportunity and diversity to staff. Information about the ethnic composition of their staff was not available.[135]

Broadcasters without a Scottish based workforce have not been included in this report.

A 2012 study by the New Statesman found that no UK national newspaper editors or political editors are non-white. Only one of the 100 most important media people listed in the Guardian's 2011 guide was non-white.[136] Since this publication, the first non-white editorial head of a UK newspaper was appointed as editor of The Independent.[137] However, The Independent no longer exists as a printed newspaper; as of March 2016, it is only available online.

There was also a significant absence of non-white minority ethnic voices from opinion and comment sections at a UK level, with the Press Gazette reporting that: [138]

- The Times having two of 39 writers with a non-white minority ethnic background;
- The Independent having one of 34;
- The Guardian having four of 48;
- The Daily Mail having zero of 23;
- The Daily Telegraph having zero of 46;
- The Daily Express having zero of 22;

[131] National Union of Journalists. NUJ Scotland champions media diversity.
[132] Creative Skillset. Employment Census.
[133] BAFTA. Lenny Henry: BAFTA Television Lecture 2014.
[134] BBC Scotland. Diversity Update – March 2015.
[135] STV. Regulator.
[136] Press Gazette. Ethnic minorities 'largely absent' from British media.
[137] The Guardian. Amol Ragan appointed as Independent editor.
[138] Press Gazette. Ethnic minorities 'largely absent' from British media.

- The Financial Times having three of 35.

Meanwhile, as stated, 14% of the UK population has a non-white minority ethnic background.

No data was available for Scottish newspapers in this study.

Representation in the media throughout the UK also varies between occupational groups, with the 2012 Creative Skillset Employment Census of the Creative Media Industries reporting that in 2012, of those working in the media in the UK, BME individuals constituted 5.4% of employees overall and:[139]

- 4.2% of those in strategic management;
- 3.6% of those in creative development;
- 5.9% of those in production;
- 8.3% of those in legal;
- 7.3% of those in broadcast management;
- 4.0% of those in engineering and transmission;
- 10% of those in editorial, journalism and sport;
- 7.2% of those in content development;
- 3.8% of those in art and design;
- 2.0% of animators;
- 5.4% of costume/wardrobe;
- 7.1% of make-up and hairdressing;
- 3.6% of camera/photography;
- 1.0% of lighting;
- 2.0% of audio/sound/music;
- 2.4% of transport;
- 7.0% of studio operations;
- 8.7% of technical development;
- 4.2% of editing;
- 6.8% of laboratories/processing;
- 0.0% of manufacturing;
- 2.4% of servicing;
- 9.4% of libraries and archives;
- 6.0% of distribution, sales and marketing;
- 7.8% of business management; and
- 4.2% of retail and exhibition.

The highest representation of BME individuals was lower in some occupational groups including as strategic management, creative development, engineering and transmission, art and design, animation, camera/photography, editing and manufacturing.

Furthermore, the report details that in 2012, while 2.5% of the working age population is BME, 3.3% of the working age BME population is employed in the creative industries, suggesting that in Scotland, BME individuals are over-represented in this sector.[140]

---

[139] Creative Skillset. Employment Census of the Creative Media Industries.
[140] Creative Skillset. Employment Census of the Creative Media Industries.

Participation in Religious Activity

At time of publication data was not readily available regarding attendance at services or participation in religious activities by minority ethnic groups.

Appendix: Key underpinning threads and questions

The concepts outlined throughout this evidence paper provided perspective and additional scope when discussing these issues in the related action forums, which had the same themes as the evidence papers.

These action forums were organised by CRER and the Scottish Government and brought practitioners, policy makers and other stakeholders together to identify priorities and solutions for each theme.

The key underpinning threads and questions for discussion listed below were used to frame and drive forward these workshops. Complete write-ups from these action forums can be found at www.crer.org.uk.

Key underpinning threads for the purposes of discussion were grouped in the following way:

Politics, decision making and governance

- Representation as elected members (MPs, MSPs and Local Authority Councillors)
- Membership of political parties, representation within their decision making structures and candidate selection processes
- Electoral registration and voting
- Representation on national, regional and local democratic structures such as Community Councils, local and national Tenants Federations, Parent Council structures at local and national level
- Influence within Community Planning structures and local governance
- Involvement and engagement of minority ethnic community groups and their representatives in decision making, policy and strategic planning processes at all levels
- Representation on Boards and Committees, including public appointments, judicial appointments, Boards of Management in the sectors including the voluntary and housing sectors and other key areas of governance

Volunteering and community action

- Volunteering with constituted volunteer involving organisations in the Third Sector
- Access to volunteering opportunities through Volunteer Centres
- Participation within smaller or informal community groups and organisations
- Participation in community based activity (clear up campaigns, fundraising events etc.) both within geographical communities and communities of interest (for example communities with shared ethnicity, religious communities etc.)
- Participation in campaigning on social issues
- The role of the third sector in capacity building for community action, participation and involvement

Arts, leisure and heritage

- Participation as audience members / service users in arts and cultural arenas such as visual arts, theatre, film, music, opera or ballet

- Participation in the creation and performance of artistic and cultural content
- Participation in leisure, sports and outdoor activities (including membership of local leisure facilities e.g. sports centres, libraries)
- Participation in heritage activities, for example visiting historical sites and museums
- Representation of minority ethnic people in campaigns relating to the national image of Scotland, including heritage and tourism marketing

At this stage of the policy development process, the following potential questions can be raised for further exploration:

Politics, decision making and governance

- How can political structures, institutions and parties use the momentum created by minority ethnic individuals campaigning on both sides of the Scottish independence referendum to boost involvement in politics and democracy more generally?
- What changes do public bodies need to make in order to move from less effective models of community engagement with minority ethnic communities to a genuinely participative, active model?
- Given the current influence of the Women 50:50 campaign for gender equality on public boards, Councils and Parliament, should a similar approach be adopted for race equality?
- How can locality-based structures such as Community Councils, tenant participation groups and housing forums and Community Planning Partnership structures become more inclusive and ensure effective representation for minority ethnic communities?

Volunteering and community action

- What can be done to reduce barriers to wider involvement in volunteering, particularly within mainstream Voluntary Sector organisations?
- How can minority ethnic participation in community based activity, social issues campaigning and other less organised forms of action be better understood and measured?
- How can we better understand the complexities of social capital, how it interacts with sense of belonging in geographical communities and its impact on participation and representation within minority ethnic communities?

Arts, leisure and heritage

- How can Scotland's arts, leisure and heritage institutions make these activities more inclusive, communicate opportunities to participate more effectively to minority ethnic communities and tackle perceptions that activities are not inclusive or suitable?
- If (as stated by Creative Scotland[141]) minority ethnic community arts organisations and artists are not yet ready for regular funding, how do they differ from those run by the majority ethnic community - what are the development needs and how can they be addressed?

---

[141] Creative Scotland. Regular Funding: Full Equality Impact Assessment (EqIA) (2015)

- How can Scotland's culture sector and creative industries best promote and encourage the talent of performers, artists and creators from under-represented minority ethnic communities?

Overarching issues

- What methods can be used to build an effective evidence base on the barriers which prevent participation and representation, including experience or perceptions of institutional and personal racism?
- How does the level of visible minority ethnic representation within workforces impact willingness to participate and be represented within institutions more broadly?
- Can development of better practice in equality monitoring of participation and representation help to disaggregate the experiences of specific minority ethnic groups, as opposed to the current approach of contrasting all minority ethnic groups with white British groups (or alternatively all white ethnic groups with non-white minority ethnic groups)?

Please note, the key underpinning issues and questioned identified here are not exhaustive.